On the importance of the decay of 234 Th in determining size-fractionated $C/234$ Th ratio on marine particles

Pinghe Cai,^{1,2} Minhan Dai,^{1,2} Weifang Chen,^{1,2} Tiantian Tang,^{1,2} and Kuanbo Zhou^{1,2}

Received 4 August 2006; revised 13 October 2006; accepted 24 October 2006; published 2 December 2006.

[1] Accurate determination of the POC^{234} Th ratio on sinking particles is essential for the application of 234 Th as a proxy for the export of particulate organic carbon (POC) from the upper ocean. Previous studies have shown that POC^{234} Th ratios may vary by as much as two orders of magnitude, but the mechanism for this variability remains poorly understood. In this study, POC^{234} Th and POC^{228} Th ratios in three particle size classes were examined for samples collected from the upper 500 m at a station in the South China Sea. Our results indicate that changes in the POC^{234} Th ratio with particle size at a given depth are mostly driven by simple decay of ²³⁴Th. In fact, various trends in the POC^{234} Th ratio versus particle size are explained by a combination of 234 Th decay and the preferential remineralization of POC relative to Th during particle aggregation. We also observed a trend of decreasing 234 Th/²²⁸Th ratios with particle size. This trend is consistent with results expected from a Brownian-pumping model. Citation: Cai, P., M. Dai, W. Chen, T. Tang, and K. Zhou (2006), On the importance of the decay of 234 Th in determining size-fractionated C^{234} Th ratio on marine particles, Geophys. Res. Lett., 33, L23602, doi:10.1029/2006GL027792.

1. Introduction

[2] Over the past decade, the naturally occurring radioisotope, ²³⁴Th (t_{1/2} = 24.1 d), has been widely used to quantify particulate organic carbon (POC) export in the upper ocean. The application of this approach requires measurement of both the depth profile of 234 Th, which is used to calculate 234 Th fluxes, and an estimate of the POC^{234} Th ratio on sinking particles to empirically derive POC export. Field observations, however, have shown that the POC $\sqrt{234}$ Th ratio on marine particles may vary from 1 to >100 μ mol dpm⁻¹. More specifically, researchers have observed various trends of $\text{POC}/^{234}\text{Th}$ ratio with particle size (see review by *Buesseler et al.* [2006]). These observations have led to the recent discussion regarding the accuracy of the 234 Th approach [e.g., *Benitez-Nelson and* Charette, 2004; Moran et al., 2003, 2004].

[3] To explain how the POC^{234} Th ratios change with particle size, several processes have been invoked, such as changes in the volume:surface area (V:SA) ratio of marine particles, rapid abiotic aggregation of small particles into larger ones, and preferential degradation or assimilation of POC relative to ²³⁴Th [Buesseler et al., 2006]. We suggest

that an additional mechanism should be considered, the decay of 234 Th. This is simply because 234 Th has a relatively short half-life ($t_{1/2}$ = 24.1d), whereas in the upper ocean, processes such as particle aggregation and export generally occur over a time scale of days to weeks [e.g., Honeyman and Santschi, 1989; Murray et al., 1989]. In a closed system, the decay of 234 Th is expected to result in an increase in POC^{234} Th ratios with particle size if one assumes negligible remineralization of POC during particle aggregation. In this study, we have designed a field experiment by applying a longer-lived Th isotope, ²²⁸Th ($t_{1/2}$ = 1.91 a) coupled with 234 Th. Since both 234 Th and 228 Th are radiogenic, i.e., 234 Th is produced through in-situ decay of dissolved ²³⁸U whereas ²²⁸Th is through decay of dissolved $2^{28}Ra$, their geochemical behaviors in seawater should be similar. Thus, determinations of size-fractionated 234 Th/ 228 Th ratio should lend insights into the possible role of the decay of 234 Th in regulating POC/ 234 Th ratio on marine particles.

2. Methods

[4] Samples in this study were collected at South East Asia Time-Series Station (SEATS; 18° N, 116° E) on a cruise in May 2005 on board R/V Dongfanghong II. SEATS is located in the northern South China Sea, and the water depth at this location is 3841 m. A large volume (500 L) of seawater was sampled at 13, 30, 52, 80, 110, 125, 150, 175, 200, 230, 260, 290, 350, 410, 450 and 500 m with an in-situ pump (McLane Lab) equipped with 142 mm diameter filtration holders. Seawater was pumped sequentially through a 53 μ m Nitex screen, a 10 μ m Nitex screen, a 1.0 μ m (nominal pore size) quartz fiber filter (QMA, Whatman), and two 5-inch $MnO₂$ -impregnated cartridges. The pump flow rates were $4-7 \text{ L min}^{-1}$. During deployment of the in-situ pump, 4 L of seawater were collected for total 234Th analyses at the same depths using Go-Flo bottles attached on a CTD rosette sampler. After sample collection, particles on the 53 and 10 μ m pore size Nitex screens were re-suspended by ultrasonication in filtered seawater and recollected on 47-mm 1.0 μ m QMA filters. The 142-mm QMA filters as well as the 47-mm QMA filters were dried overnight, and a 22-mm subsample was cut from each filter and prepared for beta counting. The remaining QMA filter material was used for the determination of natural ²²⁸Th. Analysis of particulate 234Th activities were performed at sea with gas-flow proportional beta counters (RisØ GM-5- 25) following the methods described in Cai et al. [2006a]. After beta counting, the subsamples were then used for POC measurement. POC analysis was accomplished with a PE-2400 SERIES II CHNS/O analyzer according to the JGOFS protocols [Knap et al., 1996].

¹State Key Laboratory of Marine Environmental Science, Xiamen University, Xiamen, China. ²

²Also at Environmental Science Research Center, Xiamen University, Xiamen, China.

Copyright 2006 by the American Geophysical Union. 0094-8276/06/2006GL027792

Table 1. Size Fractionated ²³⁴Th, ²²⁸Th and POC Concentration in the Upper 500 m at SEATS in the South China Sea^a **Table 1.** Size Fractionated ²³⁴Th, ²²⁸Th and POC Concentration in the Upper 500 m at SEATS in the South China Sea

[5] Analysis for total ²³⁴Th in 4-L samples was based on the small volume $MnO₂$ coprecipitation technique following the procedure described by *Cai et al.* [2006b]. Dissolved 234 Th activity was estimated by the difference between total and particulate 234 Th. For the analysis of particulate 228 Th, approximate $4-5$ dpm of 230 Th were added as a yield tracer to the remaining QMA filters. The subsequent procedure for the isolation of Th isotopes was according to Anderson and Fleer [1982]. Thorium isotopes (228 Th and 234 Th) on MnO₂ cartridges, meanwhile, were leached using $2 N HNO₃$ and H2O2 mixture [Cai et al., 2006a]. Finally, Th was extracted into a 0.25 M TTA/benzene solution, and evaporated onto a stainless steel disc. The discs were counted by alpha spectrometry in ultra ion-planted detectors (Octête™ PC) until a minimum of 500 counts of 228 Th alpha was reached. The 228 Th peak was corrected for the underlying 224 Ra activity by the analysis of the dominant 224 Ra alpha at 5.7 MeV (this correction is typically <5%). Blank activity in the QMA filter was determined to be <2% of the particulate Th activities. The collection efficiencies for dissolved 228 Th on MnO₂ cartridges were estimated from the ²³⁴Th measurements on $MnO₂$ cartridges and in seawater [*Cai et*] al., 2006a]. Thorium-228 and -234 activities were both decay-corrected to the midpoint of sampling. The associated error represents one sigma uncertainty derived from counting statistics.

3. Results and Discussion

3.1. Size Fractionated ²³⁴Th, ²²⁸Th and POC **Concentrations**

[6] Dissolved ²³⁴Th activities (<1 μ m fraction) in the upper 500 m at SEATS varied from 1.522 dpm 1^{-1} to 3.280 dpm 1^{-1} (Table 1). Particulate ²³⁴Th activities ranged from 0.0142 dpm 1^{-1} to 0.0585 dpm 1^{-1} on large particles collected on the >53 μ m Nitex screens and between 0.0109 and 0.051 dpm 1^{-1} on medium size class particles collected on the $10-53 \mu m$ Nitex screens, whereas ²³⁴Th activities measured on the $1-10 \mu m$ QMA filters were about ten times higher and ranged from 0.154 dpm 1^{-1} to 0.311 dpm 1^{-1} . Dissolved ²²⁸Th activities ranged from 16.98 dpm m⁻³ to 4.48 dpm m⁻³. Particulate ²²⁸Th activities determined on the $1-10 \mu m$ QMA filters varied from 0.608 dpm m^{-3} to 1.844 dpm m^{-3} and showed a subsurface minimum between 80 m and 175 m, possibly due to rapid particle aggregation in this depth interval. The $10-53 \mu m$ Nitex screens had ²²⁸Th activities that ranged from 0.119 dpm m^{-3} to 0.362 dpm m^{-3} , and on average, were about 50% lower than those measured on the >53 μ m Nitex screens. POC determined on the $1-10 \mu m$ QMA filters varied from 0.23 to 1.02 μ M, whereas those measured on the 10-53 and >53 μ m Nitex screens ranged from 0.034 to 0.120 μ M, and between 0.017 and 0.156 μ M respectively. POC concentrations in all particle size classes generally tended to decrease with depth.

[7] Overall, total ²³⁴Th in the upper 100 m was deficient with respect to its parent nuclide, 238 U, which was estimated to be around 2.42 dpm 1^{-1} from salinity measurements at this location [Chen et al., 1986]. Below 100 m, secular equilibrium was generally reached except at 175 m and 300 m. Radium-228 activities at this location decreased from \sim 80 dpm m⁻³ in the upper 50 m to \sim 5 dpm m⁻³ at

Figure 1. Size fractionated POC/Th ratios versus depth at SEATS in the South China Sea. (a) $POC^{234}Th$, (b) $\text{POC}^{228}\text{Th}.$

500 m (P. Cai et al., unpublished data, 2006). Total ²²⁸Th in the upper 100 m also showed deficit with respect to 228 Ra, but to a considerably larger extent than 234 Th and 238 U. Below 200 m, total 228 Th tended to be in excess with respect to 228 Ra. This general characteristic has been observed at a station close to the present study site in the northern South China Sea [Lv, 2005], and at equatorial Pacific by *Luo et al.* [1995], suggesting that ²³⁴Th and ²²⁸Th and their parent nuclides in certain environmental settings may be at steady state.

[8] Assuming constant distribution of 228 Ra over the scavenging time scale of 228 Th, we can estimate the residence times of 234 Th and 228 Th in the euphotic zone using Equation 3 presented by Luo et al. [1995]. Such an exercise showed that both isotopes have similar residence times $(1.26 \pm 0.34 \text{ vs. } 0.97 \pm 0.07 \text{ yr})$. A similar conclusion was reached by *Luo et al.* [1995]. This implies that the geochemical behaviors of these two isotopes are similar, such that at least over the time scale of the mean life of 234 Th, seasonal changes and advective/diffusive transport are unlikely to play a significant role. Note that *Luo et al.* [1995] observed differences in the behavior between 228 Th and 230 Th in the upper ocean. Based upon the consideration that ²³⁰Th has a significantly longer residence time and thus records a longer history than ²²⁸Th does, these researchers ascribed the difference to diffusive and advective input of ²³⁰Th.

3.2. POC/Th Versus Particle Size

[9] As most researchers are concerned with the application of 234 Th as a tracer for sinking particles, we will only examine the POC/Th ratios on particles of size ≥ 1 μ m, which are thought to dominate the particle export in the upper ocean. The size-fractionated \widehat{POC}^{234} Th ratios varied from 0.95 to 9.4 μ mol dpm⁻¹ (Figure 1a). The lower limit was among the lowest POC^{234} Th ratios ever measured, and can be ascribed to efficient recycling of nutrients and carbon in this regime [e.g., Liu et al., 2002]. For all the size classes, $POC²³⁴Th$ ratios generally tended to decrease with depth. This was presumably due to preferential remineralization of POC relative to ²³⁴Th. Alternatively, it can be explained by changes in surface binding ligands with depth, or simply increasing ²³⁴Th activities at depth (see review by *Buesseler et al.* [2006]).

[10] Various trends in $POC/^{234}$ Th ratios with particle size and depth are observed (Figure 1a). These include a POC/²³⁴Th ratio decrease with particle size (52-110 m, 350, and 500 m), a POC^{234} Th ratio increase with particle size (200 m), or a constant $POC^{234}Th$ ratio with particle size (30, 125, 175, 410 m). All of these trends have been observed previously [e.g., Buesseler et al., 2006; Passow et al., 2006]. In contrast, $\text{POC}/^{228}\text{Th}$ ratios generally tended to decrease with particle size (Figure 1b). The only exception to this pattern is at 200 m, where $POC/228}$ Th ratio was roughly invariant. Since the half-life of 228 Th is much longer than that of 234 Th, and likely longer than the time scale over which particle coagulation and aggregation occur, the POC^{228} Th ratio thus may be approximated as an analogue of decay-corrected POC^{234} Th ratio. It is now apparent that though there may be various trends of decayuncorrected POC^{234} Th with particle size, decay-corrected POC^{234} Th ratios tended to decrease with particle size. The decrease in POC/Th ratio with particle size can be achieved via preferential remineralization of POC relative to Th during particle coagulation and aggregation. The invariant POC 228 Th ratio with particle size at 200 m may be simply due to parallel remineralization of POC and Th at this depth.

3.3. 234Th/228Th Versus Particle Size

[11] Size-fractionated 234 Th/²²⁸Th ratios varied by more than an order of magnitude, from a low of 34 to a high of 553. Substantial variability was also evident within a given particle size class (Figure 2). This is due to the fact that 234 Th and 228 Th have different source in seawater; 234 Th is produced through the decay of conservative ²³⁸U, whereas 228 Th is added to seawater via the decay of 228 Ra, whose activity decreases from the surface ocean to a mid-water minimum (P. Cai et al., unpublished data, 2006). As a result, 234 Th/ 228 Th ratios in dissolved phase vary substantially with depth (Figure 2), causing a similar variability in particulate 234 Th/ 228 Th ratios [e.g., *Bacon and Anderson*, 1982]. Nevertheless, at any given depth $^{234} \text{Th}/^{228} \text{Th}$ ratios consistently decreased with particle size. On average, 234 Th/ 228 Th ratios on small, medium and large size class particles were 197, 133, and 81 respectively, whereas in the dissolved phase, the value was 332. The largest difference in 234 Th/ 228 Th ratios between different size class particles occurred at 300 m, where the ²³⁴Th/²²⁸Th ratio for particles >53 μ m was almost 9 times lower than in the dissolved phase. The decrease in 234 Th/ 228 Th ratios with particle size is consistent with the hypothesis of a so-called Brownian-pumping model, in which trace metals are expected to be transferred by coagulation up the particle size spectrum, from colloids

Figure 2. 234 Th/ 228 Th ratios versus particle size at SEATS in the South China Sea. Note that $23⁴Th/228Th$ ratios in the dissolved fraction $(1 \mu m)$ are also shown.

to small, and then to large particles [Honeyman and Santschi, 1989]. This trend is also expected from a reversible model for particle aggregation and disaggregation [e.g., Cochran et al., 1993] if one assumes that aggregation \geq disaggregation, i.e., that there is a net forward flow of small particles towards larger particles.

[12] Since the geochemical behaviors of ²³⁴Th and ²²⁸Th are similar, changes in size fractionated 234 Th/ 228 Th ratio at a given depth can be expressed as the following equation if there is no more particle-water exchange after coagulation:

$$
R_p = R_d \times EXP[-(\lambda_{234} - \lambda_{228})t]
$$
 (1)

where R_d and R_p represent ²³⁴Th/²²⁸Th ratios in the dissolved and particulate phases, respectively; λ_{234} and λ_{228} are decay constants for ²³⁴Th and ²²⁸Th; t is the time for particle coagulation. As $\lambda_{234} \gg \lambda_{228}$, equation (1) can be simplified to

$$
R_p = R_d \times EXP[-\lambda_{234}t]
$$
 (2)

Equation (2) suggests that variations in 234 Th/ 228 Th ratio are solely due to the decay of 234 Th. In this context, variations in $234Th/228Th$ ratio may quantitatively reflect changes in size fractionated C^{234} Th ratio that are caused by the decay of ²³⁴Th (Figure 2). Equation (2) also suggests that 234 Th/²²⁸Th ratio is a potentially useful in situ "coagulometers'' for marine particles in a steady state environment, as t (the time for particle coagulation) can be easily estimated if size-fractionated 234 Th/²²⁸Th ratios are known. In the present case, we utilized the $234 \text{Th}/228 \text{Th}$ ratios in the dissolved phase and on the large particles to determine t. Results suggest that t varied from 21 to 75 d at different depths.

4. Summary

[13] Despite over a decade using ²³⁴Th and POC/²³⁴Th ratios to determine export rates of POC from the upper ocean, mechanisms for the variability in POC/234Th ratio on marine particles remain poorly understood. In this study, we have examined, for the first time, the $POC^{234}Th$ and POC^{228} Th ratios in three particle size classes for samples collected from the upper 500 m at a station in the South China Sea. Our results clearly demonstrate that changes in POC^{234} Th ratio with particle size at a given depth are mostly driven by simple decay of 234 Th. In fact, various trends in the POC^{234} Th ratio versus particle size observed in this study can be explained by a combination of 234 Th decay and the preferential remineralization of POC relative to Th during particle aggregation.

[14] Nevertheless, our results do not necessarily mean that other processes are not important. However, without considering the effect of the decay, our interpretation for the variability in the size-fractionated POC^{234} Th ratios may be biased. For example, if volume:surface area (V:SA) played a role and the decay of 234 Th were insignificant, one would expect to see invariant 234 Th/ 228 Th ratios on different size class particles. This, however, contradicts our observations. We contend that size-fractionated POC^{234} Th and POC/228Th should be investigated over a wider range of oceanographic settings in order to fully understand the role of the decay of 234 Th.

[15] Acknowledgments. This work was supported by the Natural Science Foundation of China (NSFC) through grants 40676045, 40206011, 90211020, 40490264 and 40521003, and by the Ministry of Education through the Program for Changjiang Scholars and Innovative Research Team in University. We are grateful to M. M. Rutgers van der Loeff, C. Lamborg and an anonymous reviewer for their constructive comments. We thank the crew of Dongfanghong II for their assistance in sample collection during the cruise.

References

- Anderson, R. F., and A. P. Fleer (1982), Determination of natural actinides and plutonium in marine particulate material, Anal. Chem., 54, 1142 – 1147.
- Bacon, M. P., and R. F. Anderson (1982), Distribution of thorium isotopes between dissolved and particulate forms in the deep sea, J. Geophys. Res., 87, 2045 – 2056.
- Benitez-Nelson, C. R., and M. A. Charette (2004), Uncertainty versus variability in upper ocean carbon flux estimates, Limnol. Oceanogr., 49, 1218 – 1220.
- Buesseler, K. O., et al. (2006), An assessment of particulate organic carbon to thorium-234 ratios in the ocean and their impact on the application of 234 Th as a POC flux proxy, *Mar. Chem.*, 100 , $213-233$.
- Cai, P., M. Dai, D. Lv, and W. Chen (2006a), How accurate are 234Th measurements in seawater based on the MnO₂-impregnated cartridge technique?, Geochem. Geophys. Geosyst., 7, Q03020, doi:10.1029/2005GC001104.
- Cai, P., M. Dai, D. Lv, and W. Chen (2006b), An improvement in the smallvolume technique for determining thorium-234 in seawater, Mar. Chem., 100, 282 – 288.
- Chen, J. H., R. L. Edwards, and G. J. Wasserburg (1986), ²³⁸U, ²³⁴U and ²³²Th in seawater, *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.*, 80, 241–251.
- Cochran, J. K., K. O. Buesseler, M. P. Bacon, and H. D. Livingston (1993), Thorium isotopes as indicators of particle dynamics in the upper ocean: Results from the JGOFS North Atlantic Bloom Experiment, Deep Sea Res., Part I, 40, 1569-1595.
- Honeyman, B. D., and P. H. Santschi (1989), A Brownian-pumping model for oceanic trace metal scavenging: evidence from Th isotopes, J. Mar. Res., 47, 951 – 992.
- Knap, A., A. Michaels, A. Close, H. Ducklow, and A. Dickson. (Eds.) (1996), Protocols for the Joint Global Ocean Flux Study (JGOFS) core measurements, JGOFS Rep. 19, 170 pp., U.S. Joint Global Ocean Flux Study, Woods Hole, Mass.
- Liu, K. K., S. Y. Chao, P. T. Shaw, G. C. Gong, C. C. Chen, and T. Y. Tang (2002), Monsoon-forced chlorophyll distribution and primary production in the South China Sea: Observations and a numerical study, Deep Sea Res., Part I, 49, 1387-1412.
- Luo, S., T.-L. Ku, M. Kusakabe, J. Bishop, and Y. Yang (1995), Tracing particle cycling in the upper ocean with ²³⁰Th and ²²⁸Th: An investigation in the equatorial Pacific along 140°W, Deep Sea Res., Part II, 42, $805 - 829.$
- Lv, D. W. (2005), The particle dynamics in the twilight zone in the northern South China Sea (in Chinese), M.S. thesis, 85 pp., Xiamen Univ., Xiamen, China.
- Moran, S. B., S. E. Weinstein, H. N. Edmonds, J. N. Smith, R. P. Kelly, M. E. Q. Pilson, and W. G. Harrison (2003), Does ²³⁴Th/²³⁸U disequilibrium provide an accurate record of the export flux of particulate organic carbon from the upper ocean?, Limnol. Oceanogr., 48, 1018-1029.
- Moran, S. B., S. E. Weinstein, H. N. Edmonds, J. N. Smith, R. P. Kelly, M. E. Q. Pilson, and W. G. Harrison (2004), Rejoinder to comment: Uncertainty versus variability in upper ocean carbon fluxes, Limnol. Oceanogr., 49, 1221-1223.
- Murray, J. W., J. N. Downs, S. Strom, C.-L. Wei, and H. W. Jannasch (1989), Nutrient assimilation, export production and 234 Th scavenging in the eastern equatorial Pacific, Deep Sea Res., 36, 1471-1489.

Passow, U., J. Dunne, J. W. Murray, L. Balistrieri, and A. L. Alldredge (2006), Organic carbon to ²³⁴Th ratios of marine organic matter, *Mar*. Chem., 100, 323 – 336.

 P. Cai, W. Chen, M. Dai, T. Tang, and K. Zhou, State Key Laboratory of Marine Environmental Science, Xiamen University, Xiamen 361005, China. (mdai@xmu.edu.cn)